Teaching the C3 Framework



Disrupting Anti-Asian Violence During Epidemics: A C3 Inquiry Lesson

Sohyun An

On March 16, 2021, a 21-year-old white man traveled to three different locations in metro Atlanta and shot eight people to death.¹ Six of the victims were Asian immigrant women. A witness reported hearing the shooter say, "I am going to kill all Asians."²

As an Asian American woman living just 15 minutes from the mass shooting sites, I was beyond horrified and heartbroken. However, I was not surprised. Since the COVID-19 pandemic began in January 2020, people of Asian descent have been targeted. From coast to U.S. coast, Asian people have been yelled at, spat on, attacked, or harmed. My children and I have been told to "go back to China!" (I was born in South Korea) and to "Stay home, you sickly people!" by strangers at a grocery store and at a park.

This is far from the first time people of Asian descent have been blamed for a public health crisis. Early Chinese immigrants to the United States, racialized by the white dominant society as a dirty, diseased race, were scapegoated for epidemics in the late 1800s and early 1900s.³ Asian Americans have been targets of discrimination and hate crimes during military and economic crises, such as the massacres of Chinese immigrants in the 1800s, incarceration of Japanese Americans during World War II, and the murder of Vincent Chin in the 1980s.⁴

By inquiring into contemporary and past cases of scapegoating Asian Americans for public health crises, students can learn to debunk and disrupt these stereotypes. Such racial literacy is vital for the students to take informed action and prevent anti-Asian violence. This article presents historical background and a high school inquiry on the history of anti-Asian violence during epidemics.

Anti-Asian Racism in the United States

Since the earliest arrivals in the United States, Asian

immigrants have been viewed as "perpetual foreigners,"⁵ unassimilable to the dominant white society, and a "yellow peril" whose presence was a threat to U.S. culture, economics, politics, and health.⁶

In 1876-1877 municipal reports, for example, the San Francisco Board of Supervisors described Chinese immigrants as "a social, moral, political curse to the [white] community."7 The 1879 California State Constitution defined Chinese immigrants as "aliens who are or may become vagrants, paupers, mendicants, criminals, or invalids afflicted with contagious or infectious diseases" and as "aliens otherwise dangerous or detrimental to the well-being or peace of the State."8

Amidst an economic downturn in 1885, a mob of white miners in Rock Springs, Wyoming, angered at Chinese laborers who worked for lower wages, opened fire on a crowd of unarmed Chinese, killing 28, burned down huts and threw corpses into the flames. A grand jury did not return any indictments. A century later, in 1982, two unemployed white auto workers in Detroit, Michigan, beat Chinese American Vincent Chin to death with a baseball bat. They assumed Chin was Japanese and blamed him for their layoffs and the U.S. auto industry's meltdown at the time. Neither man served jail time.

Anti-Asian violence has also surged during wartime. For example, after Japan's World War II attack on Pearl Harbor, in the name of national security, the U.S. government incarcerated 120,000 people of Japanese descent, the majority of whom were U.S. citizens. In the wake of the 9/11 terrorist attacks, there was a sharp rise in hate crimes against South Asian, Muslim, Sikh, and Hindu communities along with Middle Eastern and Arab communities.⁹

Public health crises, such as the following, are also moments when deep seated racism against Asian Americans has escalated:¹⁰

• 1876 Smallpox Epidemic: During the 1876 smallpox outbreak, San Francisco health officials condemned Chinatown as a laboratory of infection. Officials quarantined 30,000 Chinese residents and fumigated their homes.¹¹ When this measure did little to stop the spread of smallpox, city health officer John Meares blamed Chinese residents: "I unhesitatingly declare my belief that the cause is the presence in our midst of 30,000 of unscrupulous, lying and treacherous Chinamen, who have disregarded our sanitary laws, concealed and are concealing their cases of smallpox."¹² The public panic along with strong anti-Chinese racism culminated in the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882.¹³

• 1899/1900 Bubonic Plague Outbreaks: In 1899, a shopkeeper in Honolulu's Chinatown was diagnosed with the bubonic plague. Hawaii's Board of Health soon declared a state of emergency, announcing that the "plague lives and breeds in filth and ... when it got to Chinatown, it found its natural habitat."¹⁴ The government quarantined Chinatown and ordered Chinese and other Asian residents to strip naked and take a fumigation shower.

City officials decreed that any building where someone had contracted the plague should be burned down. Although they identified 41 buildings, winds fanned the flames, and fires burned for 17 days, destroying almost all of Chinatown. Over 4,000 people–mostly Chinese residents–were left homeless.¹⁵

By 1900, the bubonic plague reached San Francisco. City authorities placed a rope cordon around Chinatown to prevent 14,000 Chinese residents from coming into contact with white residents. Sewers and dwellings were disinfected with sulfur dioxide and bichloride of mercury. The Board of Health forced Chinese residents to receive a vaccination that was still in the testing stage.¹⁶ Chinese residents fought the discrimination in court through *Wong Wai vs. Williamson* and *Jew Ho vs. Williamson*. In both cases, judges ruled the government action unconstitutional.¹⁷

• 2003 SARS: Believed to have originated in China in 2002, SARS did not spread widely in the United States.¹⁸ Nevertheless, anti-Asian rhetoric and racism ensued. For example, the *Pittsburgh* Tribune-Review published an editorial cartoon featuring a Chinese food takeout container with "SARS" written on it and a caption that read "Bad Chinese Take-Out."19 This anti-Asian rhetoric was accompanied by an avoidance of Chinese restaurants and verbal and physical attacks against Asian Americans.²⁰

• 2020 COVID-19 Pandemic: The upsurge of anti-Asian violence in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic is the newest example of scapegoating Asians for a public health crisis. Noting that the first case of the virus was reported in China, then-President Trump and his allies insisted on calling COVID-19 the "Chinese virus," "foreign virus," "Wuhan virus," and the "Kung flu." This racist framing bolstered violence against Chinese/Asian Americans. Stop AAPI Hate, a self-reporting center of anti-Asian hate crimes, began to document cases of anti-Asian harassment in mid-March 2020. Within a month, nearly 1,500 incidents were documented.²¹ The total number of reported

incidents of anti-Asian violence from mid-March 2020 to late March 2021 was 6,603.²²

In sum, the long-held characterization of Asian Americans as dangerous foreigners is still alive today. The following high school inquiry can guide students in learning about this troubling pattern and presents them with options for taking informed action. See also the Inquiry Design Model blueprint below.²³

An Inquiry Lesson on Anti-Asian Violence during Epidemics

In this inquiry, students investigate the compelling question, "Why have Asian Americans been blamed for pandemics?" The four supporting questions are: (1) What happened to Asian Americans during the COVID-19 pandemic and why? (2) What happened to Asian Americans during the 1876 smallpox outbreak and why? (3) What happened to Asian Americans during the 1899/1900 bubonic plague outbreaks and why? and (4) What happened to Asian Americans during the 2003 SARS epidemic and why? Through analysis of various sources to answer the supporting questions, students form a position on the compelling question and apply it to take informed action against anti-Asian racism and violence in the United States.

High School Inquiry Blueprint: Anti-Asian Violence during Epidemics

Compelling Question: Why have Asian Americans been blamed for pandemics?				
C3 Framework Indicator	D2. His.1.9-12. Evaluate how historical events and developments were shaped by unique circumstances of time and place as well as broader historical contexts. D2. His.2.9-12. Analyze change and continuity in historical eras.			
Staging the Question	Watch video clip discussion about anti-Asian violence in wake of the Atlanta mass shooting and engage in class conversation about epidemics and the scapegoating of Asian Americans.			
Supporting Question (SQ) 1	Supporting Question (SQ) 2	Supporting Question (SQ) 3	Supporting Question (SQ) 4	
What happened to Asian Americans during the COVID-19 pandemic and why?	What happened to Asian Americans during the 1876 smallpox outbreak and why?	What happened to Asian Americans during the 1899/1900 bubonic plague outbreaks and why?	What happened to Asian Americans during the 2003 SARS epidemic and why?	
Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task	
Write one to two paragraphs that answer SQ 1 using evidence from the sources.	Write one to two paragraphs that answer SQ 2 using evidence from the sources.	Write one to two paragraphs that answer SQ 3 using evidence from the sources.	Write one to two paragraphs that answer SQ 4 using evidence from the sources.	
Featured Sources	Featured Sources	Featured Sources	Featured Sources	
Source A: Stop AAPI Hate's National Report Source B: PBS NewsHour report on Atlanta mass shooting Source C: Washington Post report on Trump's tweet Source D: Conversation report on politics of naming Source E: WHO guideline for naming infectious disease	Source A : San Francisco's Three Graces from <i>The WASP</i> Source B : San Francisco Municipal Report 1876–1877 Source C : A call to employer by <i>Puck</i>	Source A: Photo collection from National Library of Medicine Source B: Photo collection from Hawaii State Archives Digital Collections Source C: Hawaiian Star report Source D: San Francisco Call report Source E: Article on Wong Wai v. Williamson and Jew Ho v. Williamson	Source A: CDC report Source B: Cartoon from Tribune Review Source C: New York Times article	
Summative Performance Task	Argument : Construct an argument that discusses the compelling question using specific claims and relevant evidence from historical and contemporary sources while acknowledging competing views.			
	Extension : Develop a diagram or other visualization of the repeating pattern and/or the intersection of racism, disease, media, and/or politics.			
Taking Informed Action	Understand : Research the Illinois TEAACH Act in terms of its purpose, content, and current state. Assess : Create a list of benefits and challenges in teaching Asian American history in K-12 schools. Act : Write a letter to state representatives detailing your opinion on teaching Asian American history in the state's K-12 public schools.			

Staging the Compelling Question

To stage the compelling question, have students watch a 25-minute video interview clip from Democracy Now (www. democracynow.org/2021/3/22/ anti_asian_hate_atlanta_killings). Host Amy Goodman asks Vietnamese American writer and scholar Viet Thanh Nguyen to share his thoughts on the Atlanta mass shooting and on anti-Asian violence in U.S. history in general. Have students take notes on facts and perspectives shared in the video clip. After the video, have students

use these notes while engaging in a whole-class conversation about anti-Asian racism and violence during epidemics.

SQ 1: What happened to Asian Americans during the COVID-19 pandemic and why? Featured sources for this supporting question address the upsurge of anti-Asian violence in the wake of COVID-19 pandemic and the role the media and politicians played in fueling anti-Asian racism. Source A is Stop AAPI Hate's "National Report," which provides data, patterns, and trends on anti-Asian violence

since the pandemic began. Source B is a PBS Newshour report ("What We Know About Atlanta Spa Shootings"). Source C is a Washington Post report on a study finding that "Anti-Asian Hashtags Spiked After Trump First Tweeted 'Chinese Virus.'" Source D is The Conversation's report on "Donald Trump's 'Chinese virus': The Politics of Naming." Source E is World Health Organization's announcement on the best practices for the naming of new human infectious disease. Students work through the sources to synthesize the information and

Featured Sources		
Compelling Question	Democracy Now (March 22, 2021), Viet Thanh Nguyen Speaks on Roots of Anti-Asian Hate in the U.S., www.democracynow.org/2021/3/22/anti_asian_hate_atlanta_killings	
SQ 1	 STOP AAPI Hate National Report (2021), https://stopaapihate.org/national-report-through-march-2021 Vinopal, Courtney. "What we know about the Atlanta spa shootings that killed 8, including 6 Asian women." PBS NewsHour. www.pbs.org/newshour/nation/what-we-know-about-the-atlanta-spa-shootings-that-killed-8-including -6-asian-women Salcedo, Andrea "Racist anti-Asian hashtags spiked after Trump first tweeted 'Chinese virus,' study finds," <i>The Washington Post</i> (March 19, 2021), www.washingtonpost.com/nation/2021/03/19/trump-tweets-chinese-virus-racist Viala-Gaudefroy, Jérôme and Lindaman, Dana. "Donald Trump's 'Chinese virus': the politics of naming," The Conversation. https://theconversation.com/donald-trumps-chinese-virus-the-politics-of-naming-136796 World Health Organization, "WHO issues best practices for naming new human infectious diseases," (May 8, 2015), www.who.int/news/item/08-05-2015-who-issues-best-practices-for-naming-new-human-infectious-diseases 	
SQ 2	 The WASP (1882, May 26). "San Francisco's Three Graces," https://hti.osu.edu/opper/lesson-plans/immigration/images/san-franciscos-three-graces San Francisco Board of Supervisors. San Francisco Municipal Reports Fiscal Year 1876–1877. https://archive.org/details/sanfranciscomuni76sanfrich/page/396/mode/2up Puck, "A picture for employer: Why they can live on 40 cents a day, and they can't," (August 21, 1878, p. 16), www.loc.gov/pictures/item/2002720432 	
SQ 3	 U.S. National Library of Medicine (n.d.). "1899: Bubonic plague diagnosed in Honolulu's Chinatown." www.nlm.nih.gov/nativevoices/timeline/708.html Hawaii State Archives Digital Collections. Bubonic Plague: 1900. https://digitalarchives.hawaii.gov/searchResults?query=plague&page=3 <i>The Hawaiian Star</i>, "Bubonic Plague Breed off Filth, Here" (December 12, 1899), https://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn82015415/1899-12-12/ed-1/seq-1/#words=Bubonic+Plague+Sick <i>The San Francisco Call</i>, "Danger of plague has passed, and vigilance will ensure complete safety to the city" (June 1, 1900) https://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn85066387/1900-06-01/ed-1/seq-2/#words=Plague+Bubonic+Chinatown Wang, Xiao-Wei "Plague in San Francisco and the Chinese Legal Response," (2007), www.yumpu.com/en/document/read/11418553/tangents-07-tangents-07-master-of-liberal-arts-stanford-university 	
SQ 4	 Centers for Disease Control. SARS: U.S. 2003. www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/mm5216a1.htm Tribune Review, "SARS: Bad Chinese Take-Out" (April 26, 2003), www.jstor.org/stable/42704442?seq=10#metadata_info_tab_contents New York Times, "The SARS Epidemic: In the US, fear is spreading faster than SARS" (April 17, 2003), www.nytimes.com/2003/04/17/world/the-sars-epidemic-asian-americans-in-us-fear-is-spreading-faster-than-sars.html 	

write one to two paragraphs that answer the first supporting question.

SQ 2: What happened to Asian Americans during the 1876 smallpox outbreak and why? Students examine Source A, "San Francisco's Three Graces," a picture on the 1882 cover of The WASP that depicts three ghosts representing smallpox, malaria, and leprosy, hovering over San Francisco's Chinatown (see Figure 1).



The Wasp, Vol. 8, No. 304 (May 26, 1882).

In Source B, San Francisco Municipal Reports Fiscal Year 1876-1877, city health officer John Meares defines Chinese immigrants as "a social, moral, political curse to the [white] community," blames Chinese for the smallpox outbreaks, and explains government efforts to fight the outbreak.

Source C, "A picture for employer: Why they [Chinese men] can live on 40 cents a day, and they [white men] can't," in an 1878 *Puck* magazine, depicts Chinese men as living in a crowded opium den and eating rats. A white man on the opposite page is portrayed as a father and husband arriving home from work to a household in good condition. After analyzing these sources, students write one to two paragraphs that answer the second supporting question.

SQ 3: What happened to Asian Americans during 1899/1900 bubonic plague outbreaks and why? Among the featured sources, Source A is "1899: Bubonic plague diagnosed in Honolulu's Chinatown," photos from the U.S. National Library of Medicine. Source B is "Bubonic Plaque: 1900," photos from Hawaii State Archives Digital Collections. Both sources capture the Hawaii Board of Health's response to the plague. Source C is "Bubonic Plague Breed off Filth, Here," a report on the bubonic plaque outbreak in The Hawaiian Star on December 12, 1899.

Source D, "Danger of plague has passed and vigilance will insure complete safety to the city," is a June 1, 1900, San Francisco Call article on the plaque outbreak. The article describes the San Francisco city government's response, which included guarantining Chinatown and forced vaccination of Asian residents with an experimental serum. Source E, "Plague in San Francisco and the Chinese Legal Response" (2007), explains the two 1900 court cases, Wong Wai vs. Williamson and Jew Ho vs. Williamson, in which Chinese Americans

challenged the government orders of mandatory vaccination and quarantine on Chinese residents. For the formative performance task, students write one to two paragraphs that answer the third supporting question.

SQ 4: What happened to Asian Americans during the 2003 SARS epidemic and why? Among the featured sources is the Centers for Disease Control report "SARS: US 2003." This source provides basic information about SARS and its outbreak in the U.S. Source B, an April 26, 2003, Tribune Review political cartoon, "SARS: Bad Chinese Take-Out," offers an example of media framing SARS as a Chinese disease. Source C, an April 17, 2003 New York Times article, "The SARS Epidemic: In the US, Fear is Spreading Faster than SARS," describes the SARS epidemic's impact on the Asian American community. The formative performance task asks students to write one to two paragraphs that answer the fourth supporting question.

Summative Performance Task After inquiring into the experiences of Asian Americans during four epidemics in U.S. history, students construct an evidence-based argument to answer the compelling question, "Why have Asian Americans been blamed for pandemics?" Students' arguments could take a variety of forms, including an essay, PowerPoint presentation, video, or infographic. Students' arguments may vary, but could include any of the following:

- Asian Americans have often been assumed to be the cause of a public health crisis based on long-held racism against Asian Americans as dangerous foreigners.
- Asian Americans have often been assumed to be the cause of a public health crisis based on the government framing of the public health crisis as a Chinese/Asian problem.
- Asian Americans have often been assumed to be the cause of a public

health crisis through the media framing of the public health crisis as a Chinese/Asian problem.

Students could extend the arguments by creating a diagram, a chart, or other visualization that captures the repeating pattern and/or the intersection of racism, disease, media, and/ or politics.

Taking Informed Action Finally, have students research the Teaching Equitable Asian American Community History Act, which requires teaching Asian American history in K-12 public schools in Illinois. Students can then write a list of benefits and challenges in teaching Asian American history in K-12 schools. To take action, students can write a letter to their state representatives proposing a curriculum change to teach Asian American history in their state.

Conclusion

Epidemics come and go, but the way our country responds to them has rarely changed. When epidemics arise, people look for scapegoats, and marginalized groups become easy targets.²⁴ Examples abound, such as the scapegoating of Irish immigrants for the 1832



cholera epidemic, Jewish immigrants for nineteenth and early twentieth-century tuberculosis, Italian immigrants for the 1926 polio epidemic, Haitian immigrants and gay men for the 1980s AIDS epidemic, Mexican immigrants for the 2009 H1N1 infection, and West Africans for the 2014 Ebola outbreak. Asian Americans are not the exception. Teaching students about this history can contribute to ending the historical pattern. Students should learn about persistent racism against Asian Americans and identify ways that media and politicians exacerbate anti-Asian racism and xenophobia. Such knowledge lies at the heart of the goals of a social studies education: promoting an informed, engaged citizenry and an anti-racist, anti-oppressive society.²⁵

Notes

- 1. I deliberately write "white" in lowercase in an effort to disrupt the privileging of the term and its relationship to racial domination.
- Joseph Wilkinson, "Hear It: 911 Calls from 2 Atlanta Spa Shootings Released," *New York Daily News* (March 17, 2021), www.nydailynews.com/news/national/ny-atlanta-spashootings-911-calls-20210318-555ybojhhzdt5mbwphoz5tbz fa-story.html
- J. Mohr, Plague and Fire: Battling Black Death and the 1900 Burning of Honolulu's Chinatown (Oxford University Press, 2005); N. Shah, Contagious Divides: Epidemics and Race in San Francisco's Chinatown (University of California Press, 2001).
- 4. Erika Lee, *The Making of Asian America* (Basic Books, 2016). *America for Americans: A History of Xenophobia in the United States* (Basic Books, 2019).
- 5. F. Wu, Yellow: Race in America beyond Black and White (Basic Books, 2002), p. 81
- 6. Erika Lee, America for Americans: A History of Xenophobia in the United States (Basic Books, 2019).
- As cited in J. Trauner, "Chinese as Medical Scapegoats, 1870–1905," *California History* 57, no. 1 (1978): 71–72.
- T. Hittell, ed., Supplement to the Codes and Statutes of California. vol. III (1880), 39
- 9. E. Lee, America for Americans.
- Frank Wu, "Coronavirus is not a 'Chinese Virus," *Diverse: Issues in Higher Education* (March 25, 2020), https://diverse education.com/article/170580
- N. Shah, Contagious Divides: Epidemics and Race in San Francisco's Chinatown (University of California Press, 2001).
- San Francisco Board of Supervisors, San Francisco Municipal Reports Fiscal Year 1876–1877, https://archive. org/details/sanfranciscomuni76sanfrich/page/396/ mode/2up (1877), 397.
- 13. Trauner, "Chinese as Medical Scapegoats."
- U.S. National Library of Medicine (n.d.) "1899 Bubonic Plague Diagnosed in Honolulu's Chinatown," www.nlm.nih. gov/nativevoices/timeline/708.htm.

- 15. Mohr, Plague and Fire.
- 16. A. Kraut, Silent Travelers: Germs, Disease, and the Immigrant Menace (Basic Books, 1994); Shah, Contagious Divides.
- C. McClain, In Search of Equality: The Chinese Struggle Against Discrimination in Nineteenth Century America (University of California Press, 1996).
- 18. Centers for Disease Control, 2003
- H. Hung, "The Politics of SARS," Asian Perspective 28, no. 1 (2004), 19–44.
- 20. J. Fang, "The 2003 SARS Outbreak Fueled Anti-Asian Racism. Coronavirus Doesn't Have To," Washington Post (February 4, 2020), www.washingtonpost.com/ outlook/2020/02/04/2003-sars-outbreak-fueled-antiasian-racism-this-pandemic-doesnt-have; Hung, "The Politics of SARS."
- 21. Stop AAPI Hate, 1-Month Report (2020), https://stopaapih ate.org/1-month-report
- 22. Stop AAPI Hate National Report, (2021), https://stopaapih ate.org/national-report-through-march-2021
- 23. S.G. Grant, K. Swan, and J. Lee, *Inquiry-based Practice in Social Studies Education: The Inquiry Design Model* (Routledge and C3Teachers, 2017); K. Swan, J. Lee, and S.G. Grant, *Inquiry Design Model: Building Inquiries in Social Studies* (National Council for the Social Studies and C3Teachers, 2018).
- 24. Kraut, Silent Travelers; Howard Markel, When Germs Travel: Six Major Epidemics That Have Invaded America since 1900 and the Fears They Have Unleashed (Pantheon Books, 2004).
- 25. N. N. Rodríguez and K. Swalwell, Social Studies for a Better World: An Anti-oppressive Approach for Elementary Educators (WW Norton, 2021).



Sohyun An is a Professor of Social Studies Education in the department of Elementary and Early Childhood Education at Kennesaw State University in Georgia. She can be reached at san2@ kennesaw.edu